

SCHOOL COMMITTEE

(Official Report)

Regular Meeting

April 5, 2016

Called for 6:00 PM in the Dr. Henrietta S. Attles Meeting Room, Cambridge Rindge and Latin School, 459 Broadway, Cambridge, for the purpose of discussing any and all business that may properly come before the Committee.

Members Present: Ms. Bowman, Ms. Dexter, Mr. Fantini, Mr. Harding (~~ABSENT~~), Ms. Kelly, Ms. Nolan, and Mayor Simmons (~~ABSENT~~)

Mr. Fantini in the Chair.

Also present: Student School Committee Members Griffin Andres and Ben Austin (~~ABSENT~~)

A quorum of the School Committee being present, Mr. Fantini called the meeting to order at 6:02 PM.

1. Public Comment:

The following individuals were heard:

- Milo O'Connell, Brookline St., student coordinator of the "Our Truths Theatre Initiative" which is a theatre collective created and run by 18 CRLS students; they have raised enough money to make "Our Truths" a sustainable program but are requesting funding for financing the security and custodial services for the production which has a performance date of May 26th
- David Smith, Ossipee Rd., Somerville, volunteer tutor at the CRLS Tutoring Center; he commented that he disagrees that the issue at the CRLS Tutoring Center is a personnel issue; he indicated that there are talks that the non-profit Cambridge School Volunteers (CSV) will take over the Tutoring Center next year. He expressed his thoughts that the academic integrity of the Tutoring Center will be compromised if given over to CSV and he feels there is a lack of transparency over this change. There are currently 115 volunteer tutors at the Tutoring Center and they serve over 350 students. He indicated that many tutors may leave if this change occurs.
- Lavinia Chase, Garfield Rd., Concord, volunteer tutor at the CRLS Tutoring Center; she expressed concern that Cambridge School Volunteers will not preserve the academic integrity of the Tutoring Center. She gave examples that the academic materials are more complex, tutors are at a high level of academic preparedness and have self selected to come to this center. The manager has knowledge of the teachers and the curriculum.
- Howard Bernstein, Leonard Ave., volunteer tutor at the CRLS Tutoring Center; shared that it is a wonderful program and well run and doesn't see how it could be run any better
- Elaine DeRosa, Pleasant Place, Director of Cambridge Economic Opportunity Committee, Inc. (CEOC); gave history of the Know Your Body program; noted that the CEOC has a strong partnership with the School Committee and has successfully carried out its role of promoting, preserving, improving and implementing the Know Your Body Program. She thanked the Committee for an additional year for CEOC to work with the school department.
- Tina Alu, Pleasant St., Associate Director of Cambridge Economic Opportunity Committee, Inc. (CEOC); she stated that the Know your Body program isn't just teaching in the classrooms, CEOC works with students after school and during summer camp; helps with financial education to elementary school students; provides extensive financial aid support services to CRLS seniors and their families to help them understand how to afford college; provides teacher training on STD/HIV; assists in the SNAP outreach and application process. The CEOC services provided are much broader than just classroom work.

- Elaine Schear, Amory St., Executive Director of Friends of CRLS (FOCRLS), re funding request for merger of FOCA – FOCRLS; she asked to revise a budget request from \$20,000 to \$5,000 for each of the next 3 years, or just for FY2017. This funding would support the early stages of administration of a merger between FOCA and FOCRLS.
- Elizabeth Liss, Murdock St., parent of 2 students at the Cambridgeport School and President of the Cambridgeport PTO; she indicated that the following areas repeatedly come up with parents: freeze budget initiatives called for by the Office of Curriculum and Instruction and consider possible restructuring of that and other departments; redistribute funds towards direct child focused needs; put fewer children in our classrooms and support adequate teacher student ratios; provide full time art and or music teachers to each school community; use a hierarchy of needs as the litmus for your budget decisions

Ms. Dexter moved, seconded by Ms. Nolan, to suspend the Rules to allow Ms. Liss to speak for an additional minute. It was voted to suspend the Rules for the reason stated.

- Jeff Konigsberg, Hancock St., Art teacher at Tobin and Cambridgeport, re the Visual and Performing Arts (VPA) community, budget, advocacy and meetings; he noted that he teaches more students than any other teacher in the district (505 individual students at 2 different schools) since there is no cap in the contract to protect specialists; he indicated that the VPA department evaluates them and the policy allows that the principal does not have to observe their classes. He asks that the principals observe art teachers and not someone from the VPA department. If principals observed them, they would gain a greater appreciation for what they do, the challenges they face and their budgetary needs. His current principals do observe him. The principal decides the art budget which is not consistent throughout the VPA department. He indicated that he feels there is zero advocacy for art teachers. He also stated that they miss crucial school staff meetings and planning time when the VPA department meetings take them out of the school and that there is little communication between disciplines and between art teachers.

Ms. Harding moved, seconded by Ms. Kelly, to suspend the Rules to allow Mr. Konigsberg to speak for an additional minute. It was voted to suspend the Rules for the reason stated.

- Laura Booth, Columbia St., parent of 5th grader, re Know Your Body program; she indicated that it is important that CEOC retain the contract for this program and to retain funding for CEOC going forward and their partnership with us.

On a motion by Mr. Harding, seconded by Ms. Kelly, it was voted to close public comment.

2. Student School Committee Report:

Mr. Andres reported that Mr. Austin is at baseball practice and would be late. He shared that it is an exciting time for seniors who are hearing back from colleges and making decisions. He reported that he was accepted into MIT, Harvard and BU Honors College. The “Are you smarter than a CRLS student” event happened a few weeks ago. The Club 4 student team won and donated all their winnings to their club operation. Spring sports are starting up. Mr. Andres announced that the CRLS Drama Company made it to the final round of the Annual Massachusetts High School Drama Festival and many students won individual cast awards. Mr. Andres also shared that the Glocal challenge winners made their way to Iceland and went to a summit with the prime minister.

3. Presentation of the Records for Approval:

On a motion by Mr. Harding, seconded by Ms. Kelly, it was voted to accept the Minutes of the March 15, 2016 Regular Meeting as presented.

4. Reconsiderations: None

5. Unfinished Business/Calendar:

#16-50, Grant Award: that the School Committee accept and approve the grant award below in the amount and for the period indicated.

FY16 Title 1 Distribution, for the period September 1, 2015 to August 31, 2016, in the amount of \$1,242,503.00 (increase of \$5,007.00). Project/Grant SC16604.

Description: Seven elementary schools are eligible for Title 1 services in FY16. These funds will provide academic, instructional, and support services for all low-achieving students in either reading or math, professional development activities for staff, support for parent involvement activities, as well as supplies and materials.

This increase in grant funds will be used for summer program materials and snacks. (Nolan, C16-066, 3/15/16)

Ms. Nolan indicated that her questions had been answered regarding this grant allocation. She asked that for next year we take a look at the possibility of some of the Title I funding being allocated to the Upper Schools. On a motion by Ms. Nolan, seconded by Ms. Bowman, on the following roll call, item **#16-50** was adopted: Ms. Dexter YEA; Mr. Fantini YEA; Mr. Harding YEA; Ms. Kelly YEA; Ms. Nolan YEA; Ms. Bowman YEA; Mayor Simmons ABSENT.

On a motion by Ms. Nolan, seconded by Ms. Kelly, it was voted to refer item **#16-40** to the Civic Unity Sub-Committee. **#16-40, Motion by Ms. Nolan**, whereas the Cambridge City Council discussed having the second Monday in October be designated Indigenous People's Day, per an order introduced in fall of 2015 by Councillors Mazen and Benzan and whereas several universities including Brown and several cities including Seattle WA, St. Paul, MN and Portland OR celebrate that day as Indigenous People's Day and whereas the contributions of immigrants including Italians should be commemorated, the School Committee requests that the district convene a group of staff and the CRLS student government to consider having the second Monday in October, a holiday in the school district, be renamed either Indigenous People's Day or Indigenous People's and Immigrants Day. Further that the district report back to the School Committee by the end of this school year with a recommendation. (See City Council Policy Order Resolution Calendar item) (Harding, C16-053, 3/1/16)

6. Awaiting Reports: None

7. Superintendent's Agenda:

7a. Presentations: None

7b. Innovation Agenda:

7c. Consent Agenda:

Ms. Nolan moved, seconded by Ms. Bowman, to bring forward the Superintendent's Consent Agenda and Supplemental Agenda for discussion and adoption. Ms. Nolan removed item **#16-63**. On the following roll call, items **#16-57, #16-64 and #16-65** were adopted: Ms. Dexter YEA; Mr. Fantini YEA; Mr. Harding YEA; Ms. Kelly YEA; Ms. Nolan YEA; Ms. Bowman YEA; Mayor Simmons ABSENT.

#16-57, Revisions to Rindge School of Technical Arts Program Admissions Policy, that the School Committee approve the revisions to the admission policy for the Rindge School of Technical Arts Program at Cambridge Rindge and Latin School as detailed in the document (second reading).

SUPPLEMENTAL RECOMMENDATIONS **

#16-64, Fiscal Year 2016 Supplemental Appropriation, that the School Committee approve a supplemental appropriation from the City of Cambridge to the FY2016 General Fund Budget of the Cambridge Public Schools in the amount of \$500,000.00 in the following Statutory Categories. The appropriation will be utilized to fund a projected net deficit for the district in FY2016 due to greater than anticipated costs across student transportation, out of district tuition, and student services

contracts.

Salaries, Wages & Fringe Benefits	\$	-
Other Ordinary Maintenance	\$	500,000.00
Travel & Training	\$	-
Extraordinary Expenditures	\$	-
Total	\$	500,000.00

#16-65, Contract Award, that the School Committee approve an increase to an existing contract for the following vendor for direct student services; funds to be provided from the General Fund Budget, Chapter 30B of the laws of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts having been complied with:

Center for Autism & Related Disorders, 19019 Ventura Blvd. Suite 300, Tarzana, CA, for the period July 1, 2016 to June 30, 2016 in the revised total amount of \$28,000.00

8. Non-Consent Agenda:

Mr. Harding moved, seconded by Ms. Kelly, to bring forward **item #16-63** for discussion and adoption.

#16-63, Fiscal Year 2017 Recommended Budget, be adopted as follows: that the School Committee receive and approve the FY2017 General Fund Budget of the Cambridge Public Schools in the following Statutory Categories:

Salaries, Wages & Fringe Benefits	\$ 142,145,637.00
Other Ordinary Maintenance	\$ 28,909,787.00
Travel & Training	\$ 1,009,477.00
Extraordinary Expenditures	\$ 729,079.00
Total	\$ 172,793,980.00

Dr. Young spoke of the memo he sent on Monday re FY2017 budget adjustments (on file in the School Committee office) which keeps the budget in balance. He acknowledged the Budget Sub-Committee Co-chairs for their leadership.

The Superintendent highlighted the following recommended changes to the proposed budget which were listed in Monday's memo:

- Elimination of proposed 1.0 FTE Elementary Health Teacher. This will be a cost savings of \$63,500 and is recommended in connection with the restoration of the CEOC contract.
- Revised salary estimates, based on more current information about costs for the upcoming year, resulted in a savings of \$152,000
- Reinstate CEOC Contract for Know Your Body for FY 2017 for cost of \$52,000
- Extend the School-based Social Worker Pilot for cost of \$63,500
- Improve Upper School Family Engagement/SEL adding \$25,000 to each of the four upper schools discretionary budgets total cost of \$100,000
- High School Schedule and Class size – established a reserve of three teacher (FTE's in order to be able to respond to a need for additional teachers)

Ms. Kelly noted that this is the third budget process which she has been a part of and it was quite a different situation this year in that we started with a significant deficit and a large gap. Ms. Kelly shared that she feels happy and proud of the budget process taken and that she appreciates the relationship between the City Manager, the Superintendent and the District Leadership. This relationship allowed us not to look at a deficit right now. She added that she enjoyed working with her Budget Co-Chair, Mr. Harding, and learned a lot from his years of experience. She stated that our first public hearing was held in November and we had more workshops than the previous two years which gave the Members opportunity for input. She indicated that the proposed budget does not contain any major new initiatives which she felt was appropriate since we are looking at a major

transition with the new superintendent. Ms. Kelly noted that we are continuing to grow in the areas of teacher quality, cultural proficiency and family engagement. She added that she is looking forward to voting yes on this budget. She mentioned that the Committee may need to speak on a more macro level regarding State funding on special education. Ms. Kelly thanked Ms. Spinner, CFO, for the many hours of work during this budget process.

Ms. Nolan stated that she is really torn. She added that this budget represents a step backward in terms of our ability to do evaluation of so many different programs. She gave an example of the 4th year of co-teaching of math in the 6th grade and her concern that it be evaluated so that if it works well, we would extend it and if not, we would adjust it. She would rather have more funding in the budget for evaluation. Ms. Nolan asked why we only send the budget to CPS parents and not to all Cambridge households which is what the Committee had voted previously to do. Ms. Nolan asked the Superintendent to provide a summary of any additional supports of FTE's in the elementary school budget. She added that she feels the high school staffing is below what it should be. Ms. Spinner referred Ms. Nolan to pages 32 and beginning on page 33 of the proposed budget for summation of all the adjustments in the budget and FTE changes and descriptions.

Ms. Bowman added that moving forward she would rather see discussion on staff and classroom size (ratios and formulas used) happen prior to the budget cycle so that any strategic changes could be voted on at that time.

Mayor Simmons joined the meeting at 7:20 PM.

Mr. Fantini moved, seconded by Ms. Dexter, that art teachers in all of our elementary schools be made full time and further that those schools currently without full time art teachers be required to submit a plan to the Superintendent of Schools on how the extra time will be utilized. Funds for full time Art teachers will come from unexpended funds from all Permanent Salary Accounts commonly referred to as "outages". **Mr. Harding moved a substitute motion, seconded by Ms. Kelly**, that this be effective in the budget cycle for FY2018. **Ms. Dexter moved an amendment** to the motion that we give a full time art teacher to the Cambridgeport School in recognition of their project-based program. Ms. Dexter's motion to amend failed for lack of a second.

Discussion followed on where the resources would come from if we don't have anything in the "outage" fund. Ms. Spinner added that adding these positions would come to 2.2 FTE's costing approximately \$140,000 to \$150,000, not including benefits. Ms. Spinner informed the Members that we do not have a budgeted line item called "outage". We budget the salaries to the best of our knowledge of the people being employed for the following FY year. She reminded the Members that we have just gone to the City for an additional half million appropriation for unexpected expenses in our district and would not advise the Members to use outage at this moment to resolve a budget request for next year. She usually would not know the "outage" amount available until January of each year.

Mayor Simmons offered the possibility of phasing this in by adding only one position at this time.

Mr. Fantini looked at projected year end balances which indicated that we will have \$156,000. Ms. Spinner noted that we don't have a line called "contingencies". We have wiggle room by having this "outage" amount. This year we really don't have salary outage because we need all of this and more. Mr. Fantini pointed out how important visual and performing arts in education are and how passionate he is regarding this motion.

Mr. Harding explained his substitute motion and that he wants to figure out how we move on this with STEM and STEAM. He also indicated his seriousness in having a robust elementary world language program and that flexibility would be needed. He indicated that time was needed to outline how the extra time of some art teachers would be utilized.

Some Members expressed that the extra \$150,000 for adding full time art teachers could be allocated

to other areas that they would recommend.

Ms. Kelly reminded us that we started with a deficit this year and that special education expenses are not going down; they are going up. Charter funding for the district is not known yet. Ms. Kelly indicated that we need to be careful and to leave “little bits” of money open for the new superintendent to have flexibility.

Ms. Dexter talked about phasing in the full time art position to one school and explained that a full-time art teacher for the Cambridgeport would only be .4 FTE. She added that we have a STEAM initiative, it is important to have artists in our faculty. She would like to postpone beginning the science curriculum since Dr. Salim is a science teacher and he may want to be part of that. She indicated her concern on spending \$150,000 on professional dues. She asked that we pair down some of these line items and put money back into the classroom. We need to support the Cambridgeport model.

Mr. Fantini indicated that he would accept Mr. Harding's substitute motion on good faith that effective in the budget cycle for FY2018, that art teachers in all of our elementary schools would be made full time. He hopes that administration would take another look at these schools to have .8 FTE art teacher without him making an amendment or another motion.

Mr. Harding shared that it would be important that leading up to this plan, to ask principals if this is in line with what they need.

Dr. Young asked the Committee to contemplate the idea of equity as opposed to equality.

Mayor Simmons called the question for a vote on the substitute motion. Ms. Dexter asked to calendar this item. The Mayor explained that since we are in the vote and the roll has been called, this item cannot be calendared.

On the following roll call, **Mr. Harding's substitute motion** was adopted: Ms. Dexter YEA; Mr. Fantini YEA; Mr. Harding YEA; Ms. Kelly YEA; Ms. Nolan YEA; Ms. Bowman YEA; Mayor Simmons YEA.

That effective in the FY2018 budget cycle, all art teachers in all of our elementary schools be made full time and further that those schools currently without full time art teachers be required to submit a plan to the Superintendent of Schools on how the extra time will be utilized. Funds for full time Art teachers will come from unexpended funds from all Permanent Salary Accounts commonly referred to as “outages”.

Ms. Dexter added that it is well known among Cambridge residents that our per pupil spending is the highest in the State. Another candidate posed the question of why we spend \$25,000 per pupil and not get better results. Ms. Dexter distributed and explained the following documents: CPS Enrollment of African American/Black and White Students: 2002-2015 (3rd, 6th, 10th); CPS MCAS ELA & Math Scores 2015: African American/Black and White Percent Proficient and Student Growth Percentiles; and Missing School (all on file in the School Committee office). She suggested trying a co-teaching model and adding a guidance counselor to the high school and using the funding from the position of Assistant Superintendent for Curriculum once Dr. Huizenga leaves.

Ms. Dexter moved, seconded by Ms. Nolan, that two co-teachers in first and second grade be added and that a guidance counselor be added at the high school. Discussion continued.

Ms. Bowman added that the Members were elected to this body to think strategically about the whole district. We need something to improve the quality of academic outcomes for the students who need it most. We need to leverage our resources in a way that benefit all of our students and particularly those students who are the most disenfranchised.

Mr. Fantini announced that Biogen is offering \$50,000 more to increase our guidance services here with US Buyer. Mr. Austin added that the services of US Buyer to the high school seniors has been invaluable.

Ms. Nolan indicated that these achievement gaps haven't changed over the years. She feels that we should address the class size and think holistically about how we approach this. She also expressed concerns on the need to evaluate our programs.

Mayor Simmons in the Chair.

Mayor Simmons introduced Mr. Clark who will be the Mayor's Educational Liaison to the School Committee.

Mayor Simmons shared that she is committed to having a goal setting meeting. She noted that we had five or more formal meetings of the School Committee on the budget. We also have a new superintendent starting and she feels that it is important to pass a balanced budget on to the City Council and that the budget have flexibility for the new superintendent. She reminded the Members that if they want to bring something before the School Committee, that they share the documentation in advance not only for transparency reasons but so the public and the Members have time for the thought process. She indicated that it is unfair to bring something in today. These motions should have come forward earlier in the conversation. Mayor Simmons expressed that if she is expected to vote on these motions, she would want to have them written ahead of time.

Ms. Dexter withdrew her motion. She expressed her wishes that a more detailed budget discussion could have taken place. She indicated that she supports the work and effort done on the budget but as a first time School Committee Member she has too many questions and doesn't feel she fully understands how the money is being spent so she would be voting "present".

Mayor Simmons added that she believes that this budget process was an exemplary process and asked the Co-Chairs to comment again on the budget. Mr. Harding thanked the Committee for their deep conversations and thanked the Superintendent and his staff. He also thanked his Co-Chair, Ms. Kelly, for her thoughtful commitment to being inclusive in this process. Mr. Harding encouraged the Members to bring the budget forward with confidence to the City Council. Ms. Kelly added that she supports this budget and thinks that it is the right budget for this time.

Ms. Kelly moved, seconded by Mr. Harding, the adoption of **#16-63, Fiscal Year 2017 Recommended Budget**, that the School Committee receive and approve the FY2017 General Fund Budget of the Cambridge Public Schools in the following Statutory Categories:

Salaries, Wages & Fringe Benefits	\$ 142,145,637.00
Other Ordinary Maintenance	\$ 28,909,787.00
Travel & Training	\$ 1,009,477.00
Extraordinary Expenditures	\$ <u>729,079.00</u>
Total	\$ 172,793,980.00

On the following roll call, it was voted to adopt:

Salaries, Wages & Fringe Benefits	\$ 142,145,637.00
-----------------------------------	-------------------

Ms. Dexter PRESENT; Mr. Fantini YEA; Mr. Harding YEA; Ms. Kelly YEA; Ms. Nolan PRESENT; Ms. Bowman YEA; Mayor Simmons YEA.

Other Ordinary Maintenance	\$ 28,909,787.00
----------------------------	------------------

Ms. Dexter PRESENT; Mr. Fantini YEA; Mr. Harding YEA; Ms. Kelly YEA; Ms. Nolan PRESENT; Ms. Bowman YEA; Mayor Simmons YEA.

Travel & Training	\$ 1,009,477.00
-------------------	-----------------

Ms. Dexter PRESENT; Mr. Fantini YEA; Mr. Harding YEA; Ms. Kelly YEA; Ms. Nolan PRESENT; Ms. Bowman YEA; Mayor Simmons YEA.

Extraordinary Expenditures \$ 729,079.00
Ms. Dexter PRESENT; Mr. Fantini YEA; Mr. Harding YEA; Ms. Kelly YEA; Ms. Nolan PRESENT; Ms. Bowman YEA; Mayor Simmons YEA.

Total Budget \$ 172,793,980.00
Ms. Dexter PRESENT; Mr. Fantini YEA; Mr. Harding YEA; Ms. Kelly YEA; Ms. Nolan PRESENT; Ms. Bowman YEA; Mayor Simmons YEA.

On a motion by Mr. Fantini, seconded by Ms. Nolan, it was voted to suspend the Rules for the purpose of moving reconsideration of the foregoing vote on all budget related items. The Rules having been suspended, a motion to reconsider the foregoing vote, hoping the same would not prevail, failed of adoption. All budget votes are final.

9. School Committee Agenda (Policy Matters/Notifications/Requests for Information):

On a motion by Ms. Bowman, seconded by Ms. Kelly, it was voted to bring forward items **#16-58 and #16-59** for discussion and adoption. On a voice vote, items **#16-58 and #16-59** were adopted.

#16-58, Joint Motion by Ms. Bowman and Mr. Fantini, that whereas the Ad Hoc Superintendent Transition Planning Sub-Committee was created to ensure the new superintendent acquires the necessary knowledge, support, skills, and understanding of the district in order to effectively transition into a new leadership role, and whereas it is recognized that the on-boarding process for such a significant role in the district requires more dedicated time, it is recommended that the Ad Hoc Superintendent Transition Planning Sub-Committee convene for one year. The Ad Hoc committee will work closely with Barbara Allen, the Executive Director of Human Resources, to support Dr. Salim's transition into the district through retreat planning and other mechanisms of support over the designated period.

#16-59, Motion by Superintendent Transition Planning Ad Hoc Sub-Committee, that the School Committee adopts the recommendation of the Superintendent Transition Planning Ad Hoc Sub-Committee that Dr. Salim use his remaining contracted transition days to start planning for his July 1st start date. This Sub-Committee recommends a half contracted day be used for 2-on-1 meetings with School Committee Members. During these meetings, Dr. Salim will gather insights that will assist him with building a thoughtful entry plan. A second contracted transition day will be leveraged to meet with central administrative staff to plan for summer leadership meetings. The remaining contracted time may be used for writing and completing his entry plan.

As part of Dr. Salim's official entry in July, he will finalize the formal entry plan report and present the plan - including timeline for school visits, members of a transition team (team to possibly consist of outside stakeholders), personal and district goal setting and engaging stakeholders in late July. Dr. Salim will work to align the presentation of his entry plan findings with the budget planning process of the district. Findings from Dr. Salim's entry plan work will be presented in January 2017.

Mr. Harding expressed his thanks to Ms. Bowman and Mr. Fantini for their work on this Ad Hoc Sub-Committee. He would like us to think of July 1 as a big moment for the school system as we change hands from one superintendent to another and to reflect on how we will support Dr. Salim. We need to set him up for success in his new position. Ms. Bowman framed the process for the Committee and noted that we want our new superintendent to have the supports needed so that he could be successful in his new position. She indicated that she has additional documentation and the proposed planning timeline (on file in the School Committee office). Ms. Bowman added that there should be a formal meeting of the Committee of the Whole in July at which time Dr. Salim would present his entry plan. In October, we would encourage him to establish professional goals and district goals and in January he would present the findings of his entry plan in time for preparing for the next budget cycle. Mr. Fantini noted that we are required under State Law to do an annual evaluation of the superintendent.

On a motion by Ms. Nolan, seconded by Ms. Bowman, it was voted to accept the following reports as presented:

#16-60, Report of the March 17, 2016 meeting of the Budget Sub-Committee Budget Workshop
(Committee of the whole)

Meeting of the Budget Sub-Committee (Committee of the Whole)
Budget Workshop
Thursday, March 17, 2016
CRLS Attles Room
6:00 PM – 8:00 PM

Called for the purpose of a Budget Workshop for discussion on the proposed FY2017 School Department Budget. It is anticipated that this meeting will end by 8:00 PM

Members Present: Mr. Harding and Ms. Kelly, Co-Chairs; Ms. Bowman, Ms. Dexter,
Mr. Fantini, Ms. Nolan (ABSENT); and Mayor Simmons (ABSENT)

Also Present: Dr. Young, Superintendent, Dr. Turk, Deputy Superintendent; Dr. Greer, Assistant Superintendent for Student Services; Dr. Huizenga, Assistant Superintendent for Curriculum, Instruction and Assessment; Ms. MacDonald, Assistant Superintendent for Elementary Education; Ms. Spinner, Chief Financial Officer; Mr. Maloney, Chief Operating Officer

Mr. Harding and Ms. Kelly in the Chair.

A quorum of the Budget Sub-Committee (Committee of the Whole) being present, Ms. Kelly called the meeting to order at 6:00 PM. Mr. Harding explained the purpose tonight is for discussions and to have questions answered.

Dr. Young stated that Ms. Spinner is prepared to record questions from Members and respond on the 29th. He clarified a few points made at the Regular Meeting: In regards to the partners, he wants to make sure the Committee knows that none of the partners have been cut. CHA workforce site at CRLS will continue to be level funded with a 50/50 split with CHA. We are increasing our allotment by \$10,000.00 in order to stay at level funding. City Links is being increased by Principal Smith.

Mr. Fantini:

- How close are we to 3rd grade reading proficiency level
Ms. MacDonald responded that they are looking at various assessments to record and report progress reading. There is a plan on how to meet the goals using elementary data and the phonics pilot. We are at between 68 – 70%, we are above the state, but not where we want to be.
- Will there be any reports to parents on the results of the district wide assessments
Dr. Huizenga stated we need to figure out a way to communicate district wide.
- Will we have a full time art teacher in every school
Ms. Spinner stated 2.2 total FTE are needed to make twelve art teachers full time K-12 at a cost of \$200,000.00.

Ms. Dexter:

- Will MLK lose a Title 1 teacher
Ms. MacDonald answered that there will be a summary of Title 1 staffing at all of the schools in the weekly
- Other expenses under World Language Curriculum appear low
Ms. Spinner stated world language curriculum does not usually have a lot of software expenses which keeps it low
What is the 3.4 total million

Ms. Bowman:

- On 3rd grade reading what will be put in place to track success during transition time and what are the budget implications.
Ms. MacDonald stated they have their own internal tracking system in place. There is a 3rd grade reading assessment.

Mr. Harding:

- How does this budget support innovation agenda in the upper schools and social/emotional issues.
Dr. Turk responded it was hard to find a place to put it in the budget. Since many departments own a piece of it, it is not just on one page.
Dr. Young suggested referencing pages 23, 24 and 25 in the budget book for descriptions and dollar amounts and FTE's over the past 3 years to advance those goals.
- Is there something in place to aid General Ed and Special Ed teachers coming together
Dr. Greer answered that universal design for learning (UDL) is teaching all students how to do all things and is for all students. It meets the needs for a diverse learning community. UDL is a process
- When will it be fully implemented? 4 or 5 years?
Dr. Young asked members to look at pages 41 and 42 of the budget book to see what Dr. Greer just described.

Ms. Kelly:

- Cultural proficiency program needs to be flushed out more
Dr. Young said there is money in the budget to expand
Ms. Likis explained that Cultural Proficiency Educator Team has followed up in focus groups. They prioritized, developed action plans and presented them. Two recommendations are: Exploring Cambridge, for new teachers coming to Cambridge and finding out what the lives of their students are like and Exploring Culture, the first step of which will be to identify which organization or vendor will be the best to work with on this to Train the Trainer districtwide.
Dr. Turk added Cultural Proficiency has been identified by the upper schools as a priority.
- Operations – how do we decide a building maintenance budget since we have new buildings to maintain
Mr. Maloney stated the maintenance budget can fall short in any given year because in education, maintenance is last on the list. There is a custodial handbook for the custodians to follow for routine maintenance in cleaning and daily care. There are large summer projects, i.e. painting and repairs. There is a capital budget process. There are requests now for the Kennedy Longfellow roof, boilers for the FMA and the Amigos and floors at most schools. There is a large request for security upgrades. It is up to 5 1/2 million because it is such a hot topic. Finding a balance of building a fortress vs. parent access buildings need careful attention. There are also long term capital projects to consider, i.e. the Tobin building in FY2019
- Age out and re rotating through
Mr. Maloney stated the HVACs cooling systems are quite old.

Ms. Dexter:

- Teachers are saying they need more help in the classroom, she sees no change in issues around equity
Ms. Spinner stated they have added coaches, interventionists and changed models. It is time to look at how we allocate staff holistically. They will sit with principals to understand their needs.
Ms. MacDonald stated there have been many conversations, while supporting VPA, looking at 1 full time art teacher in every school is not equitable. This year they will do the elementary program review to decide what the right staffing is.
- The community and teachers get frustrated and don't always agree with the principals
- Some teachers do not feel empowered to speak their minds to their employers without repercussions
- class sizes

Mr. Harding:

- Asked that we remember all parents do not feel the same way
- Some schools with small staff do very well as opposed to schools that need many staff
- We need to be strategic about how we use our resources

Ms. Bowman:

- How do we use the 3 floating FTEs in the district
Dr. Young stated they are usually deployed over the summer.
Ms. Spinner said they are vacant placeholder positions. For the school in question, (Haggerty) a teacher has been placed for one year.
- How difficult is it to expand the number of FTE's in case of a need for the teacher to stay longer
Dr. Young stated the challenge is to find the money elsewhere in the budget. We are in balance with the city right now; anything added will throw us off.
Dr. Greer added when you start with a base allocation and then layer it with need, the resources shift and transition.

Mr. Harding:

- Do you ever look at the data, separate of the FTE's
- What else comes into play
- Quality comes into it also, not just quantity
- Quality over quantity makes a high performance district
Dr. Young agreed with Mr. Harding stating it is not always quantity, the key is quality teachers, as an example, all teachers at the Putnam Avenue school have taken the Skillful Teacher course.

Mr. Fantini:

- afterschool programs
- SEL issues
- Are principals allowed to hire teachers from the per pupil money
Ms. Spinner stated yes, as long as they don't ask for more funds between September & June.

Ms. Dexter:

- explain class size, more teachers are needed in lower grades
- quality teachers
Ms. MacDonald stated historically, most schools were between 18-20 students for years. Prior to the innovation agenda we were concerned our classes were too small and not a healthy cohort; students became too dependent on the adult as opposed to being independent thinkers.

Mr. Harding:

- Some high performing districts have large class sizes
- Opinions differ on whether all of our teachers are quality
- What problems are not budget related
- AP classes, diversity in hiring and scheduling at CRLS

Mayor Simmons joined the meeting at (7:30 PM).

- Mayor Simmons:
Concerned about making increases and decreases
- Why so few students of color in AP
- Implied biases are carried into the classrooms
Dr. Young responded the AP topic is a good one to raise with principal Smith and added there is money set aside to reduce bias issues and advance cultural proficiency.

Ms. Kelly:

- Teacher learning team has been described, what is the social/emotional learning team
Dr. Turk answered they are interviewing and the district SEL Advisory team will be headed by someone to oversee a group representing a wide range of district and city workers that support the existing school based teams.

Ms. Bowman:

- would like to see an assessment of whether 3 FTE's will meet needs

Ms. Dexter:

- writing assignments are intensive, class size can wear a teacher down

Mr. Fantini:

- full time and part time art teachers
- Sound systems
- C'Port and Haggerty do not have an auditorium and cannot showcase their work
- AVID program in the 8th grade
Dr. Turk said we need to expand the ways in which students know about and have access to AVID, i.e. summer camps and vacation sessions.
- How many AVID seniors do we have

Ms. Bowman:

- In order to close the achievement gap we need to examine early education
- There is an early education pipeline that precedes success for students of color in AP at CRLS

Ms. Dexter stated she has a list of items and asked that the meeting be extended by 15 minutes.

Mr. Harding called a brief recess at 7:58 pm. The time for recess having expired, the meeting resumed at 8:00 pm. Mr. Harding extended the meeting by 5 more minutes.

Ms. Dexter:

- RTI staffing consultants – teachers are burned out
- Half time MSW at other schools
- People of color as para-professionals
- Downsides of using SIP funds for instruction
- Administrators at Thorndike Street

Mr. Harding asked that she email other issues, questions and concerns to Ms. Spinner, Budget Co-Chairs and the Superintendent.

Mayor Simmons:

- Know Your Body was not in the budget

The meeting adjourned at 8:05 PM

Dosha Beard

Confidential Secretary to the School Committee

#16-61, Report of the March 22, 2016 meeting of the Budget Sub-Committee Public Hearing on the FY2017 proposed School Department Budget (Committee of the whole)

Meeting of the Budget Sub-Committee (Committee of the Whole)
Public Hearing
Tuesday, March 22, 2016
CRLS Attles Room
6:00 PM

Called for the purpose of a Public Hearing on the proposed FY2017 School Department Budget. It is anticipated that this meeting will end by 8:00 PM.

Members Present: Mr. Harding and Ms. Kelly, Co-Chairs; Ms. Bowman, (ABSENT); Ms. Dexter,

Mr. Fantini, Ms. Nolan and Mayor Simmons (ABSENT)

Also Present: Dr. Young, Superintendent; Dr. Turk, Deputy Superintendent; Ms. MacDonald, Assistant Superintendent for Elementary Education; Ms. Spinner, Chief Financial Officer; Ms. Likis, Chief Planning Officer

Mr. Harding and Ms. Kelly in the Chair.

A quorum of the Budget Sub-Committee (Committee of the Whole) being present, Ms. Kelly called the meeting to order at 6:05 PM

Ms. Kelly welcomed everyone to the Budget Sub-Committee meeting and opened the hearing on the FY17 school department budget.

Public Hearing on Budget FY17 Budget:

- David Albert, Rindge Ave., Cambridge, parent and teacher, troubled by the proposed budget because it does not reflect any parent or teacher testimonies and recommendations for more para-professionals and co-teachers; assessments need to be reduced. He is requesting the budget process be redesigned, expand co-teaching in 7 & 8th grade math and add faculty at CRLS. Stop the cycle of hearing after hearing at which people speak and nothing changes.
- Ross Benson, Brookline St., Cambridge, teacher, speaking on behalf of several teachers, the testing programs School-City, Fast-Bridge and Test-Bridge only provide testing results but do not show learning and understanding; just comparisons of students, teachers and schools to each other. He suggested Cambridge follow the testing model of Finland and questions the need to spend hundreds of thousands of dollars on comparing our students test taking abilities.
- Mary-Ann Matyas, Russell St., Cambridge, parent, thanks for the instructional coaches, plea for family liaisons for middle grades; supports co teaching model in 6th grade math
- Leah Cohen, Fenno St., alumni, college student, worried about class size, pushing for more guidance counselors, excited about un tracked history class at CRLS, concerned it will not work if class size is too large
- Andrea Koschwanez, Oxford St., Cambridge, parent, representing parents of students with advanced learning needs; there is a leaky pipeline support for k-8 students, enrichment for differentiated work, adoptive tests for student who perform above proficiencies, expand intervention scope, extend social justice in education, expand existing interventionists
- Elaine O'Reily, Cushing St., Cambridge, Member of CEOC, Know Your Body is scheduled for elimination, please continue to fund the current program and extend it to 8th grade students
- Alicia Volpicelli, Sunset Rd., Cambridge, parent of 1st grade Haggerty student, thank you for taking the proposal seriously by adding another 2nd grade teacher
- Pamela Blau, Sherman St., Cambridge, happy to see UDL support, the number of teachers at CRLS are not growing enough to keep up with the growing student population
- Rose Levine, Larch Rd, teacher, appreciates the work that went into the budget document; most vulnerable students need the most experienced teachers. She sees students progress and then watch them slide down a slope and she is powerless to stop it without more coaches and interventionists.
- Jen Richards, Aberdeen Ct, parent of Haggerty 1st grader, glad to see 3rd teacher for the 2nd grade hopes to keep the class sizes small.

Mr. Harding called a recess at 6:30 PM. The time for recess having expired, the meeting resumed at 6:50 PM.

- Natasha Warikoo, Park Ave., Haggerty parent, thanked School Committee and stated she is relieved by the additional teacher
- Carroll Magill, Waterman Rd., Cambridge, parent of Haggerty 1st grader, because of positive results from 2nd grade math, reading, art, music, technology and PE students being split into groups of 10 & 12 students; teachers gave up free time, a lot of progress has been made, she

urged the School Committee to approve the Superintendent recommendation to add a third 2nd grade classroom to the Haggerty school

Mr. Harding called for a recess at 6:55 PM. The time for recess having expired, the meeting resumed at 7:15 PM.

There was a call for anyone to make public comment. There being no one else signed up to speak, Ms. Kelly announced the public hearing as closed at 7:15 PM.

Dosha Beard
Confidential Secretary
to the School Committee Office

Documents/Statements referred to during public comment: (copies on file in the School Committee office)

- ✓ Statement from David Albert

Emails received:

- ✓ Elaine DeRosa, March 22, 2016, Restore Your Body Program
- ✓ Tina Alu, March 22, 2016, Know Your Body Program
- ✓ Daniel Michaud Weinstock, March 22, 2016, Budget
- ✓ Elaine O'Reilly, March 22, 2016, Know Your Body Program
- ✓ Jill C. Kalen, March 22, 2016, extension of UDL and RTI to ALL CPS
- ✓ Andrea Koschwanez, March 22, 2016, RTI interventionist increase request

#16-62, Report of the March 24, 2016 meeting of the Superintendent Transition Planning Ad Hoc Sub-Committee

Meeting of the Superintendent Transition Planning
Ad Hoc Sub-Committee
Tuesday, March 24, 2016
School Committee Conference Room
6:30 PM – 7:30 PM

Called for the purpose of discussing transition planning for the incoming superintendent. It is anticipated that this meeting will end by 7:30 PM

Members Present: Ms. Bowman, Chair; Mr. Fantini, Ms. Nolan (ABSENT)

Also Present: Mr. Harding, Ms. Allen, Executive Director of Human Resources

Ms. Bowman in the Chair.

A quorum of the Sub-Committee being present, Ms. Bowman called the meeting to order at 6:30 PM.

Ms. Bowman distributed the proposal and the report. Ms. Allen stated that Dr. Salim has already sat in on two principal interviews and has spent some time meeting with cabinet members and Dr. Young for about ½ day, for a total of about 2 ½ days so far. The question was asked whether we need to proactively count those days into the current transition. The principal interviews will count toward paid transition purposes.

Ms. Bowman would like to have 2 on 1 meetings with Members instead of 1 on 1 conversation. The plan is for Dr. Salim to meet with central administration, and then consider the rest of his time for his entry

plan. There will be a notice of a public meeting to report his plan. The entry plan will cover Dr. Salim's first 100 days in office.

Ms. Allen asked if Dr. Salim is in agreement with what has been discussed so far; Ms. Bowman answered after conversations she has already had with him, she feels Kenny is comfortable to move forward.

Ms. Bowman suggested we need to meet at least once or twice over the summer.

Ms. Allen suggested an edit to the 2nd to last sentence in the first paragraph from "will" to "may".

It was decided to let Dr. Salim take over the hiring for Dr. Huizenga's successor.

Ms. Bowman wants us to think ahead toward a strategic plan; even though this is not the best time to plan for it, we can build toward beginning it in January of 2017. This will be in time for the budget also.

It was suggested the Committee of the whole should start meeting with Dr. Salim in April or May for 2 on 1 conversations. Although some Members may want to meet 1 on 1, Ms. Bowman would prefer 2 on 1 and intends to collaborate with the executive secretary to set up meeting times for the Committee by 2's. She is prepared to explain the rationale.

Mr. Harding was recognized by the Chair and agreed stating that 2 on 1 gives Dr. Salim protection. He does not want him to feel like he is being pushed into making premature decisions.

Mr. Harding also stated that they need to be made as recommendations. Regarding individual meetings, it may be worth asking him how he would like to utilize the meetings and what does he want to get out of them. It was suggested that Dr. Salim develop a list of questions beforehand and Members will answer his questions at these meetings.

It was proposed that the Members would give Dr. Salim the opportunity to reconnect and debrief with the search committee. It would be a good opportunity for him to see some friendly faces and seek allies. It was suggested that it happen at the Harvard Faculty Club or the Mayor's Office. Ms. Allen suggested a reception, meet and greet. Ms. Bowman stated that the Mayor wanted to do something with the City Council, Mr. Harding suggested we keep the events separate.

April Vacation week may be a good week for 2 on 1 meetings with School Committee. 1 1/2 hours for each meeting, will be a total of 3 meetings.

Mr. Harding noted that we could have a separate motion to have to have a relationship/retreat by August or September to dissect the plan. Then we do it again in January. Dr. Salim has to do a strategic plan.

Ms. Allen added that we think about the 1st year not just the first 100 days and before he starts. Then consider many mini retreats during the first year to build relationships with him and us. He's going to need the retreats to create a working relationship with the Committee.

Ms. Allen stated Cambridge is a complicated city, looking at other communities, like Weymouth, their School Committee meetings last one hour. We need to insulate him from problems with weekly check-ins. It was suggested this Ad Hoc committee stay around for 6 months to 1 year to check in with him and make sure he is safe. Or should the responsibility fall under the Governance Sub-Committee? It will need to be thought out. Should we let him hire a professional development coach? Is this in the Budget? Mr. Harding suggested we put the money aside for a coach just in case. There was agreement that it would be good to fund a professional development coach for the superintendent. Ms. Bowman added we can exercise leadership to move forward if needed. It may have budget implications.

Formally, what needs to happen? We have to do a recommendation to the committee of the whole. Ms. Bowman prefers to keep the ad hoc committee as it is and keep it for a specific time date.

Mr. Fantini suggested we call Dr. Salim and ask if he likes what we have come up with. 1 1/2 hour meetings 2 on 1. Kenny will create guiding questions, meet during April vacation time. Add in August

retreat and mini off site retreats throughout the year. He should find out what the hottest issues are, flush out the members. Adding the search committee to the timeline.

Mr. Fantini asked about the evaluation timeline and how we do the process. As part of his entry plan, Dr. Salim has to come up with personal, professional and 2 or 3 district goals by October 1st. The state process is the same. It should be done with at least 3 members.

Ms. Bowman motioned, Mr. Fantini seconded to adjourn at 7:35 PM.

Dosha Beard
Confidential Secretary to the School Committee office

Distributed Back up Documents/Handouts :-> (copies on file in the School Committee office)

- Report for the Superintendent Transition Planning Ad Hoc Sub-Committee
- Memorandum of Agreement Between CPS & Kenneth Salim

10. Resolutions: none

11. Announcements: none

12. Late Orders:

It was voted to adopt the following:

Motion by Mr. Harding, seconded by Ms. Nolan, that the School Committee send a letter of congratulations to the CRLS Boys Basketball team and Coach Dottin for winning the MIAA Division 1 championship and to send a letter of congratulations to the individual players, Jakigh Dottin and Dimon Carrigan, for being named to the Boston Herald "Dream Team" and the "Herald Team", respectively. Ms. Nolan offered a friendly amendment which was accepted by Mr. Harding to add: "Also, that the School Committee send a letter of congratulations to the CRLS Boys Basketball Team Coach, Lance Dottin, for being named Division 1 Boys Basketball "Coach of the Year" by the Boston Globe for finishing the season 25-1."

Motion by Ms. Bowman, seconded by Ms. Dexter, that the School Committee send a letter of congratulations to the CRLS Drama Company for participating in the Final round of the Annual Massachusetts High School Drama Festival 40-minute play competition and to also acknowledge those students who won individual awards.

Motion by Mr. Fantini, seconded by Ms. Nolan, that the School Committee refer the letter from Milo O'Connell and the "Our Truths Theatre Initiative" student group on funding for a play to the Superintendent.

Mayor Simmons acknowledged that this is Dr. Young's last budget with us and she thanked Dr. Young and his staff for the hard work done on the budget and for helping us to make our school system successful.

On a motion by Mr. Fantini, seconded by Ms. Dexter, it was voted to adjourn (8:32 PM).

Judith T. Martin
Executive Secretary to the School Committee

Distributed Back-up Documents (copies on file in the School Committee office):

- ✓ FY2017 Budget Adjustments (memo from the Superintendent dated 4-4-16)

- ✓ CPS Enrollment of African American/Black and White Students: 2002-2015 (3rd, 6th, 10th) (handout from Ms. Dexter)
- ✓ CPS MCAS ELA & Math Scores 2015: African American/Black and White Percent Proficient and Student Growth Percentiles (handout from Ms. Dexter)
- ✓ Missing School(handout from Ms. Dexter)
- ✓ Superintendent Transition Planning timeline (handout from Ms. Bowman)
- ✓ Milo O'Connell, CRLS student, funding for "Our Truths Theatre Initiative" (read during public comment)
- ✓ Statement from Elaine DeRosa, Director of CEOC re Know Your Body program (read during public comment)
- ✓ Statement from Elaine Schear, Executive Director FOCRLS, re budget request (read during public comment); Friends of CRLS (FOCRLS) Annual Report 2014/2015
- ✓ Statement from Elizabeth Liss, President Cambridgeport PTO, re budget (read during public comment)
- ✓ Statement from Jeff Konigsberg, art teacher, re VPA, budget (read during public comment)

E-mail communications received:

- ✓ Kristin Jelstrup re Amigos School, attached letter from Parents of rising Amigos Upper School Students
- ✓ Sarah Bennett-Astesano, support for increased staffing at CRLS; caseload of Guidance counselors
- ✓ Elizabeth J. Liss, Budget Priorities
- ✓ Elizabeth Haley, Cambridgeport Playground
- ✓ Kristina Jelstrup, More staffing in the lower grades
- ✓ Tina Alu, support of CEOC Know your Body program
- ✓ Jen Mason Stott, staffing
- ✓ Nadia Colburn, support our teachers and children; less testing/assessments
- ✓ Nhi-Ha Trinh, parking lot shuttle for King Open teachers and Staff
- ✓ Trina Abbott, budget considerations: guidance counselors and the achievement gap
- ✓ Mary-Ann Matyas, support of revisions proposed by Superintendent Young

The communications are on file in the Office of the Executive Secretary to the School Committee and can be viewed.